Enhancing Server Availability and Security Through Failure-Oblivious Computing

Martin Rinard, Cristian Cadar, Daniel Dumitran, Daniel M. Roy, Tudor Leu, and William S. Beebee, Jr.

Student presentation

Problem

- Memory Errors can cause the computation to:
 - Terminate with addressing exception
 - Become stuck in an infinite loop
 - Change flow of control
 - · Corrupt data structures that must be consistent
 - Produce unacceptable results

Problem

- Memory Errors and Memory Corruption
 - Buffer Overflow
 - Out of Bounds Array Accesses
 - Invalid Pointer Accesses
- Importance
 - Exploits
 - Program Termination / Service Availability Lost
 - System Robustness

Approach

- Failure-Oblivious Computing
 - Mechanism to protect against memory errors and corruption
 - Ignore invalid writes
 - Manufacture values for invalid reads
 - Program does not know it has made an error Oblivious
 - Program continues execution
 - · Implemented at the compiler level
 - Inserts dynamic boundary checks
 - Inserts continuation code

Evaluation

- Assumptions
 - Tests limited to buffer overrun attacks
 - Servers tested have short error propagation distances
- Weaknesses
 - Unanticipated Execution Paths
 - Manufactured results can lead the program down an unexpected path leading to incorrect results
 - Bystander Effect
 - Create dependency on the mechanism and overall production quality is decreased

Evaluation

- Strengths
 - Availability
 - Program remains available after failure occurs
 - Security
 - Program is invulnerable to common memory related attacks
 - Minimal Adoption Cost
 - Implemented by the compiler No code modification necessary
 - Reduced Administration Overhead
 - Patches for the sole purpose of fixing memory related security holes can be safely ignored

Evaluation

Evaluation

- Testing
 - Evaluated impact on several widely used opensource servers with known memory errors
 - Pine, Apache, Sendmail, MC, Mutt
 - Three versions of each program
 - Standard Compilation
 - CRED Compilation
 - Failure-Oblivious Compilation
 - Criteria
 - Security and Resilience
 - Performance
 - Stability

Pine

- Error
 - Escaping "From" field into heap-allocated buffer
- Security and Resilience
 - Standard version results in a Segmentation Fault, CRED version catches the error and terminates program
 - Both leave pine unusable as the error occurs during initialization
 - Failure-Oblivious causes field to be truncated
 - Different execution path correctly parses field allowing successful execution
- · Stability
 - 25 messages a day interleaved with malicious input
 - Input of 100,000 messages
- Performance

5	Request	Standard	Failure	Slowdown
			Oblivious	
	Read	$\textbf{0.287} \pm \textbf{7.1\%}$	$\textbf{1.98} \pm \textbf{1.5\%}$	6.9
	Compose	$\textbf{0.385} \pm \textbf{4.3\%}$	$\textbf{3.11} \pm \textbf{2.6\%}$	8.1
	Move	$\textbf{1.34} \pm \textbf{10.4\%}$	$\textbf{1.80} \pm \textbf{11.2\%}$	1.34

Evaluation

- Apache
 - Error
 - URL re-write match pattern offsets saved into static buffer
 - Security and Resilience
 - Standard version results in Segmentation Violation, CRED catches error and terminates
 - Apache starts a new child process to continue serving requests
 - Failure-Oblivious ignores the invalid writes, preventing the attack and process termination
 - Stability
 - 400 requests a day in addition to tens of thousands of requests from local box, interleaved with malicious input
 - Performance

Request	Standard	Failure	Slowdown
		Oblivious	
Small	$\textbf{44.4} \pm \textbf{1.3\%}$	$\textbf{47.1} \pm \textbf{2.5\%}$	1.06
Large	$\textbf{48.7} \pm \textbf{1.8\%}$	$\textbf{50.0} \pm \textbf{1.3\%}$	1.03

Evaluation

- Midnight Commander
 - Error
 - Accessing uninitialized buffer when parsing links in tgz files
 - Security and Resilience
 - Standard version results in Segmentation Violation, CRED catches the error and terminates
 - Failure-Oblivious allows program to continue and display results
 - · Stability
 - Daily use with interleaved accesses of problematic files
 - Performance

Request	Standard	Failure	Slowdown
		Oblivious	
Сору	$377\pm0.7\%$	$535\pm2.0\%$	1.4
Move	$\textbf{0.30} \pm \textbf{2.4\%}$	$\textbf{0.406} \pm \textbf{1.8\%}$	1.4
MkDir	$\textbf{0.69} \pm \textbf{7.0\%}$	$\textbf{1.27} \pm \textbf{6.6\%}$	1.8
Delete	$\textbf{2.54} \pm \textbf{11.3\%}$	$\textbf{2.72} \pm \textbf{11.1\%}$	1.1

Evaluation

- Sendmail
 - Error
 - Translation of address into static buffer
 - Security and Resilience
 - Standard version results in Segmentation Violation, CRED catches error and terminates
 - CRED version completely disabled by another memory error during initialization
 - Failure-Oblivious version ignores error, continues execution
 - Stability
 - Used to send hundreds of thousands of messages, interleaved with malicious input
 Request
 Standard
 Failure
 Slowdown
 - Performance

Request	Standard	Failure Oblivious	Slowdown
Recv Small	$\textbf{15.6} \pm \textbf{2.9\%}$	$\textbf{60.4} \pm \textbf{1.5\%}$	3.9
Recv Large	$\textbf{16.8} \pm \textbf{4.3\%}$	$\textbf{65.1} \pm \textbf{2.3\%}$	3.9
Send Small	$20.3 \pm 3.2\%$	$\textbf{75.0} \pm \textbf{3.4\%}$	3.7
Send Large	$21.5 \pm 5.7\%$	$\textbf{76.9} \pm \textbf{3.8\%}$	3.6

Evaluation

- Mutt
 - Error
 - Converting from UTF-8 to UTF-7 into heap-allocated buffer
 - Security and Resilience
 - Standard version results in Segmentation Fault, CRED version catches the error and terminates
 - Failure-Oblivious version effectively truncates the name
 - Stability
 - Daily use interleaved with malicious input
 - Processed 100,000 emails successfully
 - Performance

Request	Standard	Failure Oblivious	Slowdown
Read Move	$\begin{array}{c} .655 \pm 4.3\% \\ 6.94 \pm 6.2\% \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{2.31} \pm \textbf{4.8\%} \\ \textbf{9.78} \pm \textbf{6.2\%} \end{array}$	3.6 1.4

Related Work

- CRED
 - Safe-C compiler
 - Terminates the program with an error message at first memory error
 - Similar to safe languages such as ML and Java which throw exceptions
- Acceptability-Oriented Computing
 - Acceptability Properties
 - Must hold for program execution to remain acceptable
 - Acceptability Enforcement
 - Built by programmer to ensure Acceptability Properties hold

Related Work

- Buffer-Overrun Detection Tools
 - StackGuard
 - StackShield
- Rebooting
- Manual Error Detection and Recovery
 - Failure Recovery Blocks and Exception Handlers
 - Programmer anticipates error, provides recovery strategy
 - Data Structure Repair
 - Programmer provides data structure consistency specification

Related Work

- · Variants and Extensions
 - Boundless Memory Blocks
 - Insert code to save invalid writes into table to retrieve later
 - Redirected invalid access back at appropriate offset
- Transactional Function Termination
 - Dynamically detect Buffer Overflows
 - Terminate Execution of function immediately.
- Static Analysis
 - Program Annotations
 - Heuristics

Result

- Failure-Oblivious Computation
 - · Enhances availability, resilience, and security
 - Error does not corrupt address space and data structures of the computation
 - Continued execution through error
 - In many cases, converts unexpected or malicious input into a predetermined error case
 - Possible solution to one of the main goals of computer science
 - Create robust, resilient software that handles unexpected errors