Paper Review Form

Reviewer Name: Shasha(Amy) Liu


Section I. Overview

A. Reader Interest

1. Which category describes this manuscript?
   ___Practice/Application/Case Study/Experience Report
   _x_ Research/Technology
   ___Survey/Tutorial/How-To

B. Content

1. Please explain how this manuscript advances this field of research and/or contributes something new to the literature.
   The paper presents a model YAGO, which is the first approach that accomplishes the unification between WordNet and facts derived from Wikipedia with an accuracy of 97%. And it is a light-weight and extensible ontology with high coverage and quality.

C. Presentation

1. Does the introduction state the objectives of the manuscript in terms that encourage the reader to read on?
   _x_ Yes
   ___Could be improved
   ___No

2. How would you rate the organization of the manuscript? Is it focused? Is the length appropriate for the topic?
   _x_ Satisfactory
   ___Could be improved
   ___Poor

3. Please rate and comment on the readability of this manuscript.
   ___Easy to read
   _x_ Readable - but requires some effort to understand
   ___Difficult to read and understand
   ___Unreadable

Section II. Evaluation

Please rate the manuscript. Explain your choice.
   ___Award Quality
   _x_ Excellent
   ___Good
Section III. Detailed Comments (provide your thoughts/criticism about the ideas in the paper; not only summarize the paper but have a critical look here)

YAGO model, which the paper presents, builds ontology by extracting relations from Wikipedia categories. What is more, it is the first approach which employs heuristic rules and WordNet during the extraction and gets high precision. However, YAGO only extracts values for a limited number of predefined relations.

Additional Comments:
1. Provide one aspect that you liked the most in this paper.
   It is the first approach which combines WordNet and Wikipedia to build an ontology. And it presents results of high quality.

2. Provide one aspect that you disliked the most in this paper.
   It only presents the extraction of values for a limited number of predefined relations.

Section IV. Discussion Points (provide at least 3 discussion topics/questions related to ideas/techniques described in the paper; these will be used for discussions in the class)
1. Can YAGO extract values for larger number of relations? Or it is YAGO’s intrinsic limitation of extraction of certain types of relations as it does not explore the free text which is main source of relations.
2. YAGO uses Wikipedia as a corpus, and learns relations using substantial manual effort. Can it learn relations automatically?
3. The comparison of YAGO and OWL and OWL 1.1.